Health Workforce Planning and Research: What Are the Issues?

Cluj School of Public Health

October 2, 2019

Jean Moore
Center for Health Workforce Studies
School of Public Health | University at Albany, SUNY
jmoore@albany.edu
The Center for Health Workforce Studies at the University at Albany, SUNY

• Established in 1996
• Based at the University at Albany School of Public Health
• Committed to collecting and analyzing data to understand workforce dynamics and trends
• Goal to inform public policies, the health and education sectors and the public
• Broad array of funders in support of health workforce research
Today’s Presentation

• Changes in health care delivery: workforce implications
• Health workforce planning: who, where and why?
• CHWS: Health workforce research and monitoring
The Changing Health Care Landscape

Goals

• To expand access to basic health care services
• To provide high quality, cost-effective care
• To improve population health
What’s Changing in Health Care?

• Shift in focus away from acute care to primary and preventive care
• Service integration: primary care, behavioral health and oral health
• Better coordination of care
• Payment reform, moving away from fee-for service and toward value based payment
  o incentives for keeping people healthy and penalties for poor outcomes, e.g., inappropriate hospital readmissions
Health Care Delivery Under Health Reform: Guiding Principles

• Patient-centered care
• Coordinated care across different providers
• Active management of transitions across care settings
• Increased provider communication and collaboration
• Clear accountability for the total care of the patient

www.chwsny.org
Workforce Implications of Health Reform

• New models of care are emerging (e.g., Patient Centered Medical Homes, Accountable Care Organizations, Preferred Provider Systems)

• Team-based approaches to care are frequently used

• Team composition and roles vary, depending on the needs of the patient population and workforce availability

• Teams may include: physicians, NPs, PAs, RNs, social workers, LPNs, medical assistants, and community health workers, among others
Multidisciplinary Teams Appear to Have Positive Impacts on Patient Outcomes

• “The provision of comprehensive health services to patients by multiple health care professionals with a collective identity and shared responsibility who work collaboratively to deliver patient-centered care.”


• Research suggests health care teams with greater cohesiveness and collaboration are associated with:
  o Higher levels of patient satisfaction
  o Better clinical outcomes

• The most effective and efficient teams demonstrate a substantial amount of scope overlap – i.e., shared responsibilities.
So What’s the Problem?

- Inadequate primary care and behavioral health capacity
- Maldistribution of available workforce
- Health professions students are not consistently exposed to team-based models of care or trained in emerging functions
- Scope of practice restrictions
  - Health professionals not always allowed to do what they are trained and competent to do
  - Shared responsibility (scope overlap) needed for team-based care is challenging to achieve
Primary Care Health Professional Shortage Areas in Upstate New York
Primary Care Health Professional Shortage Areas in New York City
Are We Training the Health Workforce for Team-based Practice?

- Health professions education and training typically occurs in **disciplinary siloes**
- The **focus on specialized clinical roles** can interfere with delegation and collaboration on teams
- Doctors, nurses, and others get **little guidance on how to interact effectively** with each other in support of team care
- There’s **limited exposure to newer models of care** that demonstrate use of group-based decision making
Are We Training the Health Workforce for Emerging Functions?

- Effective chronic disease management
- Patient engagement
  - Health coaching
  - Motivational interviewing
- Care coordination
- Population health
- Data analytics
State Perspectives on Health Workforce Planning
State Responsibilities That Require Health Workforce Planning

• May play key roles in health reform initiatives
• Support state funded health professions education and training programs
• Regulate health service delivery
• Provide or support the provision of local public health services
• Offer incentive programs to address need in underserved areas
• Administer state health insurance programs
New York’s Health Reform Programs

**Delivery System Reform Incentive Payment (DSRIP) Program**
- Large-scale reform of the delivery system accountable for safety net patients
- 25% reduction in avoidable hospital use over 5 years

**State Health Innovation Plan (SHIP) State Improvement Model**
- Integrated, value-based care through population health-based care delivery models and payment innovation
- 80% of New Yorkers impacted within 5 years

**Goals**
- Large-scale reform of the delivery system accountable for safety net patients
- 25% reduction in avoidable hospital use over 5 years

**Scope**
- All providers that qualify as Safety Net providers, along with coalitions (PPS) of other proximate providers
- All Medicaid patients attributed to those coalitions
- All primary care practices
- All payers
- All New Yorkers

**Units**
- Provider Performing Systems (PPSs)
- Primary care practices (of any size or affiliation)

**Payment models**
- Provider incentive payments based on project milestones and outcomes; Value Based Payment
- Range of payment models, unique to payers but aligned across them, including P4P, shared savings, capitation, etc.
What are some of the unmet needs (clinical or non-clinical) of Medicaid patients that contribute to inappropriate ED visits or hospitalizations?
Social Determinants of Health

• “the conditions in which people are born, grow, live, work, and age”


• The influence of social and socio-economic factors on health status and health outcomes, including:
  o Demographics
  o Educational attainment
  o Income
  o Employment
  o Community

• Protective social factors: social support, self-esteem, self-efficacy
Hot Spotting

- From mapping crime to mapping the location of health care super utilizers
  - Between 2002 and 2008, 900 people in two buildings in Camden NJ accounted for over 4,000 hospital visits and $200 million in health care bills
  - 1% of 100,000 people using Camden’s medical facilities accounted for 30% of its costs
- ED visits and hospital admissions are often failures of prevention and timely and effective care

www.chwsny.org

*The hot spotters: can we lower medical costs by giving the neediest patients better care?* Atul Gawande. *New Yorker*. 2011 Jan: 40-51.
Who Are the Super Utilizers?

• Multiple co-morbidities – diabetes, asthma, CHF
• Unhealthy life style
  o Tobacco, alcohol and substance abuse
• Unstable housing
• Limited income
• Non-compliance with treatment
Workforce Strategies to Address the Needs of Super Utilizers

- Community health workers
- Care coordinators
- Care managers
- Peer support workers
- Health educators
In the U.S., States Are Primarily Responsible for Regulating Health Professions

State Regulations

- Definitions
- Describes Regulatory Body
- Title Protection
- Professional Qualifications, Education and Training
- Competency/Certification Requirements
- Licensure Process
- SOP Including Limitations and Exceptions
- Licensure Renewal
- Discipline Process
- Continuing Education
- Appeals Process

www.chwsny.org
Interest in Scope of Practice Regulation is Increasing

• Key goal in health care in the U.S. is expanded access to basic health services

• Anticipated growth in demand for high-quality, cost-effective basic health services, particularly for underserved populations

• Restrictive scopes of practice are sometimes seen as an access barrier to needed health services
What is Scope of Practice?

- Professional scope of practice, i.e. professional competence, describes the services that a health professional is trained and competent to perform.
- Legal scope of practice, based on state-specific practice acts, define what services a health professional can and cannot provide under what conditions.
- Legal scope of practice and professional competence overlap, but amount of overlap varies by state and by profession.
Issues With State Based Health Professions Regulation

• Mismatches between professional competence and state-specific legal scopes of practice
• Lack of uniformity in legal scopes of practice across states for some health professions
• Lack of flexibility to support shared responsibility (scope overlap)
• The process for changing state-specific scope of practice is slow and adversarial
State to State SOP Variation: Nurse Practitioners

View the interactive version online: www.bartonassociates.com/np-laws

DISCLAIMER
This chart is for informational purposes only and is not for the purpose of providing legal advice. You should contact the applicable nursing board or your attorney for specific legal advice.

RESOURCES
AANP - www.aanp.org
The 2012 Pearson Report - www.webnponline.com
The Nurse Practitioner’s 24th Annual Legislative Update - www.tnpj.com

www.chwsny.org
State to State SOP Variation: Creates Opportunities for Comparative Effectiveness Research

• Traczynski J, Udalova V. Nurse practitioner independence, health care utilization, and health outcomes [Internet]. Madison (WI): University of Wisconsin; 2013 Mar 15 [cited 2013 Oct 9].
  • Available from: http://www.lafollette.wisc.edu/research/health_economics/Traczynski.pdf

SOP Restrictions Limit Shared Responsibility and Delegation

• Emerging titles
  o Dental therapists
  o Advanced dental hygienist therapists
  o Community paramedics

• Shared responsibilities
  o Pharmacists administering flu shots
  o Home health aides administering prepackages medication
SOP Policy Reform Strategy
Alaska Dental Health Aide Therapist (DHAT)
Targeting Underserved Populations

• Started in 2003
• Only serves Alaskan tribal communities
• Trainees recruited from local tribal communities
• Education: certificate program with 20 months plus 400 hours of supervised clinical training
• DHATs provide a range of OH services including: prevention, education, diagnosis and treatment of dental caries, basic restorative care.
Alaska Dental Health Aide Therapist (DHAT) Evaluation Findings

• DHATs provide safe, competent, and appropriate care

• Tribal communities in Alaska report increased access to oral health care
  o Reduction in wait times
  o Reduced travel times

• Patients are very satisfied with care from DHATS

• Wide acceptance of DHATs in the communities they serve
Dental Therapy: New Strategy for Affordable Dental Services

• Recognized in 5 states: Minnesota (2009); Maine (2014); Vermont (2016); Arizona (2018); Michigan (2018); New Mexico (2019); Idaho (2019); Nevada (2019); Connecticut (2019).

• Recognized in tribal communities in Alaska, Washington State, and Oregon.

• Other states considering DT legislation include Florida, Kansas Massachusetts, North Dakota, Ohio and Wisconsin.

• In some states where DTs are recognized, enabling legislation requires that a certain percentage of the DT’s caseload be considered ‘underserved’

• Evaluations to date find that DTs provide high quality, safe and cost-effective care.

https://www.pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/articles/2016/04/5-dental-therapy-faqs
States Are Adopting Their Own Strategies to Expand Access to Needed Health Services

+ Designed to address local needs and considers factors unique to that state

- Continues to contribute to state-to-state variation in SOP, training, qualifications for similar titles
  
  o More convergence in these emerging models across states is likely over time
Developing a Tool to Measure Dental Hygiene SOP Variation

- **Scope of practice (SOP) varies** considerably by state
  - different models of public health supervision practice
- **Permitted tasks and required supervision differ** by state and these differences impact service delivery
- **Dental Hygiene Professional Practice Index (DHPPI):**
  - Developed in 2001 and used to score state dental hygiene scope of practice in 2001 and again in 2014
- **DHPPI contains numerous variables grouped into 1 of 4 categories:**
  - Regulation, supervision, tasks, and reimbursement
- **Numerical scoring based on each state’s law and regulation**
  - Possible composite score from 0-100
State DHPPI Scores in 2014

• Descriptive analysis
  2001 scores -10 in West Virginia, 97 in Colorado
  2014 scores -18 in Alabama and Mississippi, 98 in Maine.
  Mean score on the DHPPI 43.5 (2001) ↑ 57.6 (2014)

• Factor Analysis
  In 2014, exploratory and confirmatory factor analysis
  confirmed that the component structures were all
  aspects of the overarching concept (in this case
  scope of practice)

• Statistical analysis
  In 2001, SOP was positively but not
  significantly associated with the percent of the
  population in a state having their teeth cleaned
  by a dentist or dental hygienist in the past year.
  
  Research question in 2014: Is SOP associated with
  population oral health outcomes?
  Used multilevel logistic modeling with the DHPPI
  an BRFSS data controlling for state and individual
  level factors including community water
  fluoridation, demographic and socioeconomic
  factors.

  Finding: More expansive SOP for DHs in states was positively and
  significantly associated (p<0.05) with having no teeth removed due to
  decay or disease among individuals in those states (published in
  December 2016, Health Affairs)
Developing a Dental Hygiene SOP Infographic: Why and How

• Research finds that broader SOPs for DHs are associated with better oral health outcomes
• There is substantial variation in DH SOP across states, but no easy way to help policy makers understand these differences
• Researchers developed an infographic that depicts state variation in scope of practice for select dental hygiene functions
  o With an emphasis on those functions that support community based practice
Variation in Dental Hygiene Scope of Practice by State

The purpose of this graphic is to help planners, policymakers, and others see differences in legal scope of practice across states, particularly in public health settings.

Research has shown that a broader scope of practice for dental hygienists is positively and significantly associated with improved oral health outcomes in a state's population.¹ ²

* In Colorado, indirect supervision requires only preapproval, not the presence of a dentist.


This work was supported by the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) of the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS), under the Health Workforce Research Center Cooperative Agreement Program (UB1HP27843). The content and conclusions presented herein are those of the authors and should not be construed as the official position or policy of, nor should any endorsements be inferred by HRSA, HHS or the U.S. Government.

This graphic is for informational purposes only and scope of practice is subject to change. Contact the applicable dental board or your attorney for specific legal advice.
Federal Support for Health Workforce Planning
Health Resources and Services Administration

- To support more informed health workforce decision making through available health workforce data, projections and information
- To promote equitable supply and distribution of well-prepared health workers to ensure access to high quality, efficient care for the nation
National Center for Health Workforce Analysis

• Cooperative Agreements with Health Workforce Research Centers
  o UAlbany School of Public Health New York – oral health workforce, technical assistance
  o UNC, North Carolina – workforce innovation
  o University of Michigan – behavioral health
  o GW, Washington DC – workforce innovation, health equity
  o WWAMI, Washington State – allied health, health equity
  o UCSF, California – long term care
FQHCs and Integration of Oral Health with Primary Care

• Integrated service provider, federally funded

• Elements of successful integration:
  o Interoperable EHRs connecting medical and dental records
  o Team based care with cross-trained providers
  o Oral health workforce innovations
    - Dental therapists
    - Advanced dental hygienists
    - Community dental health coordinators
  o Knowledge of ‘local circumstances’ in planning OH strategy
Health Workforce Research in New York
Health Workforce Research Questions of Interest Are Changing

• Tended to be siloed: how many? where? do we have enough?
• Now we ask broader questions: what do patients need; what are the best workforce strategies to deliver these services?
• Examples of studies:
  o State-specific oral health access issues and potential workforce strategies
  o Use of telehealth services by providers in New York, barriers and facilitators
  o Medicaid claims analysis to better understand commuting patterns for care
Health Workforce Data Collected in New York

• **Supply:** Re-registration surveys

• **Pipeline:** Nursing Deans, Doctors completing GME training in NY

• **Demand:** Surveys of HR Directors in hospitals, nursing homes, home health agencies, clinics
Surveys of:

- Newly trained physicians
- Licensed
  - physicians
  - nurse practitioners (mandatory)
  - physician assistants
  - midwives
  - registered nurses
  - dentists
  - dental hygienists
Nurse Practitioners
Mandatory NP Re-Registration Survey

• Effective September 1, 2015, NPs licensed in NY are required by law to provide information to the state at the time of license renewal
  ○ Renew their licenses every three years for each NP certification held

• DOH, SED and CHWS worked collaboratively on survey design and data collection

• CHWS downloads survey responses quarterly and cleans the data

• Aggregated data drawn from NP survey responses are required by law to be made available publicly
Nurse Practitioner Re-registration
Survey Annual Response Rates, 2011-2016
The NP Re-registration Survey

- Based on federal Minimum Data Set recommended guidelines
- Includes 22 questions
  - Licensure
  - Demographics
  - Education
  - Practice characteristics
  - Future plans
  - Collaborative practice
Supply Data Describes Regional Supply and Distribution Trends

Estimated Count of Patient Care NPs per 100,000 in New York State by Region
75% of the State’s NPs are Actively Practicing in New York

- Working or Volunteering as NP: 75%
- Working only as RN: 12%
- Not Currently Working/Retired: 11%
- Working by Neither as NP nor RN: 2%
The New York Resident Exit Survey

- Conducted annually since 1998 (except for 2004 and 2006)
- A survey of all residents and fellows completing training in New York (approximately 5,000 annually)
- Substantial support and assistance from GME directors and programs directors
- Average annual response rate greater than 60%
- Survey asks about:
  - Demographics and background
  - Post-graduation plans
  - Characteristics of post-graduate employment
  - Job search experience
  - Impressions of new physician job market
## Changing Demographics and Practice Settings for New Physicians

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principal Practice Setting</th>
<th>NY Residents/Fellows, 1998</th>
<th>NY Residents/Fellows, 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percent Female</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent URM</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Less than Half of New Physicians Plan to Practice in New York After Completing Training

In-State Retention After Completing Training by Year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Retention Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Proximity to Family was the Most Frequently Cited Reason for Leaving New York to Practice

Principal Reason for Practicing Outside New York in 2018

- Proximity to Family: 29%
- Better Salary Offered Outside NY: 17%
- Better Jobs in Desired Location Outside NY: 10%
- Cost of Living in NY: 8%
- Climate/Weather in NY: 6%
- Better Jobs in Desired Practice Setting Outside NY: 6%
- Overall Lack of Jobs in NY: 6%
- Better Jobs Outside NY that Meet Visa Requirements: 5%
- Better Job for Spouse/Partner Outside NY: 4%
- Never Intended to Practice in NY: 4%
- Other Reason: 2%
- Taxes in NY: 2%
- Cost of Malpractice Insurance in NY: 1%
- Cost of Starting a Practice in New York: 0%
Likely to Practice in the State After Completing Training

In-State Retention After Completing Training by High School Location, Medical School Location, and Citizenship

- NY High School Grad and NY Medical Grad: 81%
- Non-NY High School Grad and NY Medical Grad: 56%
- Other US Medical Grad: 41%
- NY High School Grad and US Citizens who are IMGs: 74%
- Other US Citizens who are IMGs: 35%
- Foreign IMGs: 29%
More New PC Physicians Plan to Work in Inpatient Settings in New York

Source: Center for Health Workforce Studies

www.chwsny.org
## Important/Very Important Job Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic</th>
<th>Not at all Important</th>
<th>Of little importance</th>
<th>Important</th>
<th>Very Important</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Predictable start and end time each workday</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
<td>47.3%</td>
<td>40.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of each workday</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>50.6%</td>
<td>39.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of overnight calls</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>39.8%</td>
<td>52.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of weekend duties</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>41.6%</td>
<td>51.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Measuring Relative Demand by Specialty

• Difficulty finding a satisfactory practice position
• Changing plans due to limited practice opportunities
• Number of job offers
• Assessment of regional job market
• Assessment of national job market
• Change in starting income over time
Relative Demand by Individual Specialty

- Highest Relative Demand
  - Family Medicine
  - Emergency Medicine
  - General Internal Medicine
- Lowest Relative Demand
  - Pathology
  - Radiology
  - Pediatric Subspecialties
Gender Differences in Physician Income*, 2001-2016

*in 2016 Dollars
## Gender Differences in New Physician Income by Primary Care Specialties, 2014-2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specialty</th>
<th>Income Difference</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family Medicine</td>
<td>-$20,134</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General IM</td>
<td>-$15,214</td>
<td>.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Pediatrics</td>
<td>-$2,759</td>
<td>.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obstetrics/Gynecology</td>
<td>-$12,697</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Future of RN Workforce in NY

- Currently there is a relative balance between the supply of and demand for registered nurses (RNs) in New York State, with the supply of RNs being slightly greater than the demand.

- Demand for RNs in New York is expected to grow between 2015 and 2025, but supply should be sufficient to meet demand.

- Supply/demand balance could be influenced by:
  - New state law, BSN in 10, requires RNs to obtain a baccalaureate degree (BSN) or higher in nursing within 10 years of initial licensure.
  - The impact of changes in health care on future demand for RNs: declining demand for RNs in acute care could be offset by an increase in demand for RNs in ambulatory care.
Demand Surveys Provide Evidence of HWF Recruitment and Retention Issues

- Involves collaborations with provider associations
- NY providers reported:
  - All providers: experienced RNs hard to recruit, but newly trained RNs are not
  - Hospitals: Hard to recruit and retain clinical laboratory technologists, HIT staff and medical coders
  - Nursing homes and home health: Hard to recruit occupational therapists, physical therapists, speech language pathologists, dieticians/nutritionists
  - Community health centers: Hard to recruit dentists, geriatric nurse practitioners and psychiatric nurse practitioners
Case Studies on the Use of Telehealth Services by NY Providers

• Providers used a variety of telehealth applications to expand access to needed services:
  o Behavioral health
  o Home care monitoring
  o Diabetes self management
  o Pediatric primary care
  o Wound care
As We Plan for the Future

• Use data and evidence to inform decisions
• Build strategic partnerships
• Explore innovative approaches to training and service delivery
• Evaluate the impacts of these efforts on cost, quality and access to care
• Disseminate findings from evaluation studies to further refine programs
Thank You